

SOCIO-POLITICAL CONSTRUCTS OF DYNASTIC POLITICAL ELITES OF PAKISTAN

Gull-i-Hina

Assistant Professor, History Department,
Lahore College for Women University, Lahore
gul.hina@lcwu.edu.pk

Tayyaba Sohail

Assistant Professor, Department of Sociology,
School of Social Sciences and Humanities (SSH)
University of Management and Technology
C-II, Johar Town, Lahore, Pakistan.
tayyaba.sohail@umt.edu.pk

Tania Sohail

Pakistan Post Model Girls High School, Multan Road
Lahore

ABSTRACT

The dynastic political elites are those individuals who are descendants of the major political party. In the case of Pakistan, it is the PPP and PML (N), both political parties PPP and PML (N) has increased its campaign-led behavior by citing the leadership charisma of the people, party identity and economic and educational reforms in party manifesto. During the years 1988-2013, only two parties were associated with Pakistan electoral system including PMLN and PPP who took control of the assembly by winning the election. The paper aims to highlight the circumstances in which the people vote for the electoral party during the election. The broader interpretive research design was used to collect data from 30 voters, i.e. 10 voters of PPP, 10 voters of PML-N and 10 voters of other parties who casted their votes during the elections of 1988 to 2013. The findings of the study suggest that party age and political socialization played vital role in determining the voters' affiliation with the party. However, respondents found unclear while reporting their party choices for the elections of 2018.

Keywords: Dynastic Political Elites, Election Campaign, Party Manifesto, Pakistan People's Party (PPP), Pakistan Muslim League-Nawaz (PMLN), Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf (PTI).

INTRODUCTION

Dynastic politics is not a new phenomenon in Pakistan. Both the major ruling parties of Pakistan, Pakistan People's Party (PPP) and Pakistan Muslim League Noon (PMLN), qualify as dynastic elites. Dynastic elites are mostly found in third world countries such as India, Philippines, Thailand, Indonesia, and Singapore (Purdey, 2016). The tradition of dynastic politics has been developing in these countries since the non-dynastic elites face more challenges than dynastic elites such as financial issues, establishing credibility in political spheres, attracting voters and managing the vote bank (Akhtar and Mushtaq, 2014).

The dynastic political elite has a powerful impact on the electoral system because people of Pakistan cast their votes due to their affiliation with the power of political families. Essentially, the party affiliation is based on the family voting trends, emotional attachment, biradari system and so forth. The parties usually make voting calls in the name of their senior political leaders, their sacrifices and their development tasks and so forth. It shows that the political dynastic leaders impact the voting behaviours. Building upon this argument, the current study tends to explore the factors which affect voting behaviour of the people of Pakistan.

REVIEW OF LITERATURE

"Elite" is the term of the English, but it restructured to the French word, it is also invented from the Latin word "eligere". The superior, top, exceed people denotes the term Elite. In the system of politics,

the followers of elites protected a large part in political offices. The leading class of society of all the offices is shared by men fitting in the Marxian and his follower's view. The brand name identification is beneficial for the people who are the dynastic elites in the politics, they did not use their financial resources as much as the non-dynastic elites used, and dynastic elites get the votes only on the name of the party. They get their votes only on the popularity of the party name. They also get an advantage in the election campaign; most of the people come to their rallies due to the party affiliation of that member. They emphasise the dynastic elites of theorisation, features of their occurrence or their employment. It similarly gives importance to the Pakistan's dynastic elites and their jobs. (Mushtaq & Mushtaq, 2014)

The term governing elite in the context of Pakistan also explain different types of elites such as governing elites, political elites or decision maker. The term political elite is used anonymously which refers to the "power", it means the powerful members of the government who make a meaningful choice on the decision on the different matters. (Carl & Dellal, 1965, 1979). Governing elite, power elite or ruling elite all are labeled as the elite in a political sphere. Cronyism and nepotism are frequently used for the public office when the political parties recruit the candidates. These terms are also employed in the form of the dynastic political elites because the people of the dynastic families used their brand name for the election campaign and tried to fill site on the name of the favouritism. (Nadler & Schulman, 2015)

According to Constantine Menges (1968), "in society, a high position held by the elite is a descriptive term." There are two types of the elites such as governing elites (directly or indirectly take part in the consecutively the government) and non-governing elites (influence the major discussion of government through different means). In Southeast Asia, by the comparers of the various countries such as Philippines, Thailand, Indonesia, Singapore take as an example as the former and current leaders of the dynastic elites. He also shows how the political power transfers from one member to the other member of the same family so the new members cannot enjoy the power. (purdey, 2016). The dynastic elites come to the local as well as to the national level. In the contemporary political, the contrast of the family, patronage and dynasty has an emphasis in the Philippines, Thailand, Singapore and Indonesia. The transfer of wealth and power from one generation to the next in the same family by a variability of the political system is stated as a political dynasty. (McCoy, 2002, 2001)

There are so many factors to formulate the voting behaviour of electorates. Gender, class, language, race, peer groups, race, religion, occupation, support for the specific ideology, affiliations with the specific group, agenda or the policies, political campaigns are the main sources of the social identities. Media also shapes voting behaviour like experience, political culture, history, direct socialisation or values are also included. (Mohammad, 2014).

For taking the vote, it is essential for the candidate to campaign before elections. In a constituency, candidate's influence, as politicians their past performance, the primary factor such as on which political party the candidate is nominated. In the large cities like Lahore, voters know about their political rights, due to the development of the electronic media in the recent years. Due to the awareness of the people, it is important for the candidate to highlight the international issues as well as the national issues in their campaign. (Usman, Munawar, & Amjad, 2013)

There are short or long term factors which affect the voting behaviour of the people. The short-term is related to the current situation of the state. As well as the long run is referred to the party identification, party age, loyalty and so forth. For the democratic system, the elections are an essential feature, which focuses on the formation of the government and the structure of the politics for the creation of the country. (Shively, 2006) However, election polling inspires the voters to cast a vote in an organized way. (Ranney, 1993)

The ideology of the party, the leadership of the party, the manifesto of the party, staff for campaign and the political workers all are different factors which are necessary for the electoral campaign. (Ranney & Trent and Friedenberg, 1993, 2003, 2008). On the other hand, the entire social factors such as the money, language, caste system, religion and so forth. are important for the electoral campaign. For the success of the candidate, it is important to compete in the elections through the electoral campaign (Pattam, 2006).

Election 2008 to 2013 and role of political Elite dynasty

After the death of General Zia, the new journey of the politics' is ongoing as political dynastic elite rule in Pakistan by the two primary parties such as PML and PPP, Nawaz Sharif and late Benazir Bhutto (BB) are supervised the parties simultaneously. Before General Musharraf entered into politics PPP and

PML governed twice from 1988 till 1999 simultaneously. In 1999 another dictatorial semi-military period began and in 2008 when general polls started then the semi-military dictatorial period came to an end. For the main two leaders Late Benazir Bhutto and the Nawaz Sharif and for all the Democrats it was a hard time. Everything was in the hands of the Pakistan Army and 1999-2002 there were three years of Chief Executive of the country as General Musharraf. Through the “controlled referendum” the General Musharraf became President, and through a 17th amendment, he approved his act from the parliament. PPP and PML-N made as alliances with the moderate forces on the lines of religious parties known as ARD.

In 1988-90 and 1993-96 the chairperson of PPP Benazir Bhutto was elected as a prime minister two times. As well as Nawaz Sharif the Quaid of PML-N was elected as a prime minister two times 1990-93, 1996-99. Now in 1990's, both parties were thoughtful claim and concerns of dishonesty against each other, and the case was framed in the liability courts. On October 12, 1999, President General Pervez Musharraf peaceful coup by discharging Nawaz Sharif government. The late Benazir Bhutto, Chairperson of PPP and Asif Ali Zardari her spouse followed the case of the corruption by Pervez Musharraf and also put the Sharif brothers behind the slabs.

Benazir, Nawaz both made alliances against the military dictator and tried to reappearance to the country for the formula of power sharing. Before the election, both the leaders of the parties tried their sources to return to the country. For the promotion of the politics, both the parties adopted a distinct sequence, but the sudden death of the Benazir. The chairperson of PPP on 27 December 2007 by the attack of the gun, the rival turned friends get them another chance to refreshing the democracy in the true essence after the death of the Benazir. In the name of reconciliation both the parties sat together in the national and provincial assemblies on February 18 general elections but the elections were rescheduled on January 8, 2008. Six decades-old history of Pakistan reflects its political-cum-constitutional crisis which dominant the role of the military chiefs and the bureaucracy. After almost nine years of 1956 constitution of its existence, the country is not agreed on it.

In 1999, the Nawaz Sharif's government was terminated by General Pervez Musharraf. In 2001, once again the political parties were banned from the local elections in the era Pervez Musharraf's even informally, they were active in the elected councils. By the names of the different political parties, they took part: Ihtsaab group (Jamati Islami), Quaid-e-Azam group (PMLN), Istekham-e-Pakistan group (PML), Awam group (Pakistan Awami Tehreek), and so forth. Male or female local candidates were more than 80% which belonged to the political parties. (Abid, 2005). In Pakistan, Zulfikar Ali Bhutto earned the most popularity and confidence of people than any other political figure. To date, no other political leader can gain that power and fame. He served for one political tenure but has become the legend, and the dramatic rise and fall of the party always give the call to their voters in the name of Bhutto. After his killing the power transferred to his daughter, Benazir when she electioneered the people wept as “Jiye Bhutto!” “Bhutto Lives!” in the Sind and Punjab. (Wolpert, 1993) The campaign strategy adopted by PTI created great impact on the vote bank of Pakistan; especially women voters cast their votes with great enthusiasm to Imran Khan. There was a number of family clashes were reported that a number of women refused to cast vote with the will of their families. A number of people convinced against the political inheritance system and dynastic political elite.

THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

The conceptual underpinning of the current paper lays its foundation on the Sociological Model (School of Columbia), Social-Psychological Model (The School of Michigan) and Economic/Rational Choice Model (Sarlamonov & Jovanoski, 2014).

School of Columbia and voting prejudices:

The School of Columbia (Sociological Model) points that social factors such as the stability in the voting for the particular party, the race, class, religion prejudice influence the voting behavior of the voters. Attracted to the special party to vote for them, the choice of the family in voting is also important. Vision and choices of families influence their children and they make sure that their children should vote for the party of their choice. In case of Pakistan, there is a collective culture of families in which the opinion of families matters the decisions like deciding the parties to vote for. If the head of the family is willing to vote for PPP or PMLN, then the whole family goes to vote for that one party due to the respect of that head of the family. For the particular study, the social factors which the researcher is

talking about includes; the influence of the family, the name of the Party, family affiliation with the particular party, the biradri system and so forth. They can be the vital factors which affect the voting trends in Pakistan.

Approaches of the school of Columbia (sociological model)

There are two approaches of the sociological model of the voting, i.e. micro-sociological approach and macro-sociological approach.

Micro-sociological and macro-sociological approach:

The micro-sociological approach keeps its focus at the individuals and closer social environment. Ideological voting is also observed as the sociological model of the voting. Lipset, Rokkan (1967); Rokkan (1970) established an approach of macro-sociological which is constructed on the basic conflict of universal adoption. The basic conflict of the individuals involved in their represented social group. The people of the city relate to the particular social group on which their interest is related and gave their vote to that particular political group. (Dalton & Wattenberg, 1993). According to the individual biases of the politics, the voters cast their vote to their popular group is the first discovery by the politician of the country (Campbelet al., 1944). If we talk about Pakistan, the people of the Pakistan have their political biases such as they have their reasons for the liking of the particular party. The researcher is going to find the reasons why the people of the Pakistan have little biased about the PPP and PML-N. There are many grounds for that bias such as the regional areas; mostly the PPP get the votes from the Sindh and PML-N from the Punjab area. There are some more reasons such as the linguists, religion and so forth.

School of Michigan and voting prejudices:

The school of Michigan is well-known by the psychosocial model which means the factors which affect the voting behaviour of the society, i.e. the party identification, party age, specific group attachment and so forth. Michigan model, behaviourist theory or the behavioural school of leadership, identified leadership behaviour (Thomassen and Rosema, 2009). The theory used the term of party identification as “personal affection with the sense of the specific impressions of his choice on the party.” Party identification initially refers to the long-term psychological identification and some known as “partisan self-image”. The affiliation with the political party is the psychological long-time attachment (Compbel et al., 1960).

In case of Pakistan, there are very few powerful families who have qualities of the leadership. Those families became as some dynastic political elites in Pakistan; the power is transfer to the one member to the other member of the same family due to this cycle the transfer of the power, the non-elites do not come into the power.

Theory of party identification:

Theory of party identification has the social psychological association/reasons. The party identification started at the primary level of the people’s lives with the help of their parents by the method of the political socialisation. With the passage of time, people feel more involved with the party. Party identification has two types of influence, i.e. long-term influence and short-term influences. In the case of Pakistan, the long-term psychological attachment is the PPP. The people are still having the emotional attachment with the Zulfikar Ali Bhutto. Thus, it refers the role of family and peer associations are quite important in developing party identification, the system of the party and planned voting motivations. The party identification may affect significances and the development of the nature of the social group. (Georgia, 2005) (Crewe, Miller, Weisburg, 1960, 1976, 2001)

Party identification measured through group socialisation:

The panel socialisation also measures party identification. People show attachment to the parties as a group as well such as ethnic group, linguistic group, religious groups and other social groups have a special affection to the party of politics. (Compbelet al., 1960). Pakistan has a cultural diversity which make people link with a particular party due to their own religious and ethnic belongings.

Party age:

In the case of Pakistan, party age is also important; it means that when the party is formed and how they work and how the people get attached to that party. If the party is newly formed, then it is difficult for the people to cast their vote for that party because they do not trust the newly formed party easily. On the other hand, if the party is old then people easily attach to the party and have faith in them that they do well for them. In the case of Pakistan, the PPP is formed in (1970); the Zulfikar Ali Bhutto is the

senior member of that party. People of Pakistan have an emotional attachment to him after him the power is transfer to the daughter of Bhutto, Benazir Bhutto people of the Pakistan was affiliated with her. She takes the position of her father with the same manifesto. She was a first female Prime Ministry of the Muslim country; she is the inspiration for all the females out there.

Types of party identification:

Party identification has two types of influence, i.e. long-term influence and short-term influences.

Long-term influence:

Long-term influence of Party identification leads to the choice of the voters as they got influence from the image of the candidate and the image of the Party. If the party is formed since long time then the people of the country associate better with the candidate images, party images as well as the issues of which the party is going through just an example of PPP and PMLN the people of Pakistan is linked with them because they know how much they do struggle for Pakistan.

Short-term influence:

The short-term influence leads to the issues, the image of the candidate as well as the image of the party, these all effect the trends of the voting. In the case of Pakistan, these are very important because this influence is temporary in making the opinion of the voter.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

The study was conducted within the broader interpretive research design using semi-structured interviews as a tool of data collection. For semi-structured interviews, a list of already prepared open-ended questions was made to examine and explore the perception and experiences of the participants about the political dynastic system of Pakistan. The thematic analysis technique was used for analyzing and reporting of the data. Taking into account ethical considerations, anonymity and confidentiality were strictly followed. The written consent was taken from the respondents. Before taking consent, a brief introduction of the research was given to the participants. The sampling universe of the present study were voters of Lahore district. Considering the election durations, the voters were segregated into two categories using purposive sampling technique. 5 voters of PPP, 5 voters of PML-N and 5 voters of other parties were recruited who casted their votes from 1988 to 2013.

They were recruited to understand their understanding of the political dynastic system. Their responses provided insight about the social factors that influenced their voting such as family, caste, geographical boundaries and biradari system. Moreover, they were an important data source to understand their influence on the next generation of voters. The second category of voters included 5 voters of PPP, 5 voters of PML-N and 5 voters of other parties. They were literate, university voters with the age of 22-30. They recruited to know the awareness of the young people of Lahore about the dynastic political elites and emergence of their new young leaders of the different parties. Therefore, total of 30 voters participated in the study, 10 from each section of the sample i.e., 10 voters from PPP, 10 voters from PML-N and 10 voters of from other parties.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Interview finding of affiliation of voters with PPP:

This section only deals with the supporters of PPP with the group of respondents from 1988-2013 and 2008 to 2013.

Party age, party affiliation and perception of voters about PPP (1988-2013, 2008-2013):

This era is quite significant due to Bhutto's assassination and PPP introducing Benazir Bhutto as a first female leader of the entire Muslim world. Furthermore, 2008-2013 was another important era for PPP as the party was appearing after BB assassination end of Marshall Law

Party identity:

To understand the voting behavior of voters, it is vital to know that how they associated themselves with the particular party and their association with the party leaders. The identified reason for casting the vote for PPP showed that the people perceived that Benazir Bhutto was the daughter of Bhutto, so she could do better work. It shows the initial step of the political dynastic elite from PPP.

People identify PPP as the party of Bhutto even after his demise. People's association with Bhutto and PPP, made them inspired to vote for Benazir Bhutto (BB). She inspired most of the people to vote for her as well as Bhutto her father, his name with her played a vital role to get maximum votes.

Like the voter of 1988 – 2013, voters of 2008 – 2013 associated them with the PPP because for them it was the AAM AMAW (common people) party which had worked for the betterment of general masses. All members of the party were common people who could relate to the issues of the people.

Party age:

Party age was identified as the vital factor to people for casting their votes as most of the respondents were agreed that the party age is important but now the new trend showed that the youth is not considering the party age as an important factor. While one of the respondents projected that the party age was not important but the leadership counts.

The result suggested that voters of 2008 to 2013 also agreed that party age is important because the political experience plays important role in solving the problems rapidly. Moreover, party age broadens the vision of the people, and they provide better work ideas.

Party achievements:

The achievements of the party was segregated as; political party's achievements, achievements of party members and achievements of party leaders. Firstly, the researcher asked about the political party's achievement in the result of this, all the respondents were well aware of the political party's achievements. Most of the respondents indicated the labor reforms, relations with China and the agricultural reforms were the main achievements. The next sub-question was about the achievement of the person. Resultantly, most of the respondents indicated that Benazir was new in politics and no one identified the achievements of BB but she got votes in the name of Bhutto. That was a sign of the emergence of political dynastic elites. Third sub-question was about the achievement of the party/leader in the result of this all the respondents well aware of the achievements but all of them identified different achievements as Hajj flights, women empowerment, freedom of press and so forth. It means they are attached with them through their reforms as well.

The voters of 2008 -2013 era were also found well aware about the party achievements. The identified achievement includes; work for the women, agricultural reforms, labor reforms and economic stability. The identified person's achievements were as; resolved the war prisoners matter with India, work for the poor people, Islamic block setup.

Psychological Attachment:

Psychological attachment was also explored in the study and attachment was categorized as attachment with the party and the party's leadership. The findings show that basically the people of Pakistan are attached to Bhutto. On Bhutto's assassination people were emotionally disturbed but when Benazir Bhutto actively participated in politics and worked for the general masses then they gave her vote in the name of Bhutto. Personalities found to be important while casting votes as the findings showed that the people of Lahore voted for Bhutto for the personality. They added that Bhutto had all the qualities and ideas to rule after Quaid e Azam. He was the only leader who felt the pain for us. The subsequent query was about casting a vote for the same party and person (in other elections as well). People were very emotional because of the death of Benazir Bhutto they cast their votes for PPP in 2008 for the sacrifices of BB and the Bhutto. However, after coming in power they did not fulfill their loyalties so all the people changed their party and gave the votes to PTI in 2013 elections.

The dynastic nature of Pakistani politics reflected further as people voted for the Bhutto family as in Bhutto then his daughter and then in the hope for the Balawal Bhutto. However, after they changed their leader and gave votes to PTI for the leadership of Imran Khan. According to the respondents Imran Khan was the reflection of Bhutto in his approach and ideas.

Political socialization:

Voters from both eras (1988 – 2013 and 2008 -2013) reported family influences on the voting choices. The finding suggests that mostly the family members were involved and influence the voting trends of the people. Both, the young and old family members influence the voting trends of their families. Moreover, old family members forced them to give their votes to PPP and now a new trend of the young members' influence them to vote for PTI so both ends are influenced in a reciprocal way.

Charisma of party and party leadership:

Appearing of party and party leaders in difficult is vital to understand the view of people towards party leaders as charismatic. Respondents of both eras (1988 to 2013 and 2008 to 2013) reported that BB had a charming personality as well as she had knowledge of social, economic and political avenues. In addition to the leadership of PPP, people believed that a very positive role has been played by PPP as

they considered PPP as the AAWI party, they knew all the work of the party and that helped the people to affiliate with PPP and also the communication with the people made PPP as a charismatic party.

Respondents were clear that the charismatic leaders should have strong visual presence and countenance/speech. The result showed that BB had a very strong visual presence, she proved that women can work at any platform with modesty and decency, the way she dressed up was one such example. Furthermore, BB had good communication skills. She did not have good command on Urdu but she knew how to speak and communicate the ideas thus, can represent Pakistan well on international forums.

Furthermore, the people of Lahore were very much clear that the leader must have the quality of building innovative ideas/ communicate a vision to their supporters and BB had those qualities. The next question was about the ability to easily gather support, finding was in 1988 BB was introduced by PPP and all the supporters of PPP were emotionally disturbed when BB came to people. People supported her but that remained blurred as the support was for Bhutto or for Benazir Bhutto.

Party manifesto:

People were clearly communicated about the party's manifesto. The findings suggested that the people of Lahore were well aware of the manifesto. They all identified the different reforms about the party such as, education for all, jail reforms, freedom of speech and freedom of press, decentralization and devolution, fulfilling the basic needs of the poor people of the country as Roti, Kadpa, Makan (bread, clothes and house), work for the students and peasants and so forth..

Future perception of the Pakistani politics:

The result for the support of next generation of the party was random. Some respondents gave the answers in a positive way, they were ready to support the next generation and some of them gave a negative response in a way that they appreciated the party's work only. The next question was about the party choice for 2018 elections, there is also a mixed response of the supporters in a way some were still loyal to the party and gave vote to PPP on the other hand some of them gave votes according to the work of the party.

Perception of voters of PPP (voted during 1988 --2013 and 2008-2013 Elections):

This era was essential because the Marshall Law was ended, Benazir Bhutto came back to Pakistan and her death made the people emotionally disturbed, then the last hope for the Bhutto family arose when Balwal Zardari Bhutto came but he did not participate in the elections. According to this some questions were asked by the respondents the first question was about the people's identity of PPP which had a sub-question, by asking about the reason for casting vote to PPP in the result in 2008 to 2013. The main reason for casting vote was the reforms of the party and the identified reforms such as education, agriculture, industry, and defense, reforms for the poor and reforms for the women.

In contrast to the voters from 1988 to 2013, voter from 2008 to 2013 found to be clear to vote for PPP in the upcoming elections.

Perception of voters of PMLN voted in 1988-2013 and 2008-2013 elections:

PMLN came in elections in 1988 as a separate party before they were as PML. PMLN was headed by Nawaz Sharif and his brother Shahbaz Sharif. In this party, there were dynastic elites of a brother, but then they were introducing their children. Their children are Maryam Shareef and Hamza Shareef, and they are also doing lots of social work for becoming elections highlighted in the country. The era of 2008 to 2013 is crucial for PMLN as the military rule of Mushraf was ended as well as the Benazir Bhutto died which made hope for the PMLN party as well as PMLN supporters as winner.

Political identification:

The result showed very strongly that people vote for PMLN first time for the firm leadership and their reforms. In the regard to political identification, respondents (1988-2013) reported that the people of the country were very well attached to the party members. They considered the members as a noble and wise persons. They thought they do the better work for the poor people and took the progress the country to next level.

The respondents from the era of 2008-2013, respondents were giving vote to PMLN for the main reform of the economic upbringing in the country; the party did a lot for the masses. Furthermore, the people were well aware about the political works and the main focus was on the development of infrastructure of the country and to empower the general masses. They believed that PMLN is best among all other parties to deliver their projects.

Party age:

In lieu of the importance of party age all respondents were in favour of party age. Party age is important because people have more experience and can solve their problems with their experience as well as knowledge. On the other hand, few of them were of the point that ideas and working ability are important for the party which establishes in any part with the duration of party age.

Party attachment:

The psychological attachment with the party was reported as Muslim League was the old party, but then Nawaz Shareef established a separate party as PML-N. The party was formed by common people of the country and was united under the great leadership and doing a great job for the general masses of the country. The respondent also showed personality attachment as the findings showed that the people voted on the personality basis, that he has a strong personality. They considered their leader as honest and loyal with people and had wise ideas for doing work for the country's poor people. In the quest of casting a vote for person/political party/ family, the respondents (1988-2013) reported that they voted for both, the individual and political party. Nawaz has always made remarkable policies for the people as well as the party.

Political socialization:

The political socialization also played significant role in developing a party attachment. The findings showed that the respondents knew their democratic rights as a civil person but they family interest in PMLN strengthen their party affiliation.

Political achievements:

The findings about the political party's achievement showed that the supporters of PMLN were well aware of the political party's achievements. The identified achievements by the respondents were infrastructure, education, health, trade, defence, industry and so forth. In terms of personal of the leaders, the findings showed that the development infrastructure, education sector improvement, health, metro line, orange line, CPEC and industry all were the result of their leader vision so categorized them as person's achievements.

The voters from 2008 to 2013 identified the accomplishments of their leaders. The identified works were the development of the roads, reforms for foreign policy, transport projects such as motorway and the decision for the nuclear test.

Charismatic leadership:

It is considered essential for the party leader to be charismatic leader and showing best of his strengths in most difficult times. The findings showed that the people of Lahore agreed that the Leader (Nawaz) was nationally as well as internationally famous. He knew people's problem and knew how to solve them too. People considered him a strong leader and believed that the party became famous as well as the strongest party at national level.

Respondents (1988-2013) were aware about the party manifesto and identified as areas of working were; reforms on the economic development and infrastructure development. They related that the clarity of manifesto is the manifestation of the clarity of the vision of their leader.

The voters from both eras of PMLN gave high importance to the high visual presence, looks/ speech and communication skills of their leader. The finding showed that the supporters of PMLN agreed that the party, as well as the leader, have the quality to communicate with the people of the country according to the respondents the increased votes is the proof of excellent communication skills.

In addition to the interpersonal skills, the voters of PMLN, believed that their leader has the charisma to gather support from the people due to his personality, reforms and performance. The voters from (2008 – 2013) reported that Nawaz Shareef is a true leader and they consider him as a Lion and think that he is brave. He faced so many difficulties such as exile by Musharraf. He is a good negotiator, so people trusted him and voted for him.

Future perception of Pakistani politics:

The findings showed that all the respondents did not agree to vote next generation in the name of the forefathers. They believed to vote by performance except for the one respondent who thought that next generation was the best custodian of their ancestors of the party and principles. To identify the party choice for 2018 election, respondents (1988-2013) of Lahore have a mixed response; half of them were still willing to vote for PMLN in the upcoming elections. While on the other hand, the half of them were not willing to give further support to PMLN due to their corruption and they turn to the PTI due to their vision and the emotions for the people of the Pakistan.

The respondents from 2008 to 2013 reported that they intend to cast future vote for PMLN due to the leadership was same, fulfilled their promises, and faced all the hard time for the country by exile. They also agreed to vote the next generation because they believed that Hamza Sharif and Mariam Sharif belong to the political family and they are brought up in the political family. They know all the hardships which are faced by their forefathers, and they also know the problems which are encountered by the people of the country. Thus they can do lots of work.

However, few of the respondents said that they are not willing to vote their children because there is no kinship. Some of the interviewees wanted to evaluate the work and then vote.

CONCLUSION

To conclude, PPP and PMLN are the dynastic political elites of Pakistan. As the parties are in the transition phase of transferring the party inheritance to their children i.e. Balawal Bhutto, Asifa Bhutto in PPP, Maryam Nawaz and Hamza Shahbaz in PMLN. It is pertinent to highlight that the findings of the study are in aligned with the conceptual framework of the study and positively showed that social factors like party affiliation, family influence, age etc are the vital factors to determine the voting trends in Pakistan.

Voters align their voting decision with the party manifesto and then compare the party progress and leader success accordingly. Voters found to be favoring the parties when their show commitment to the development issues and propose solutions such as reducing employment, controlling inflation, curbing corruption, focusing educational reforms, and criticizing establishment and maintaining accountability. However, it has also been found that the young people support a particular political system, which is related to the infrastructural development.

Mixed responses were found while reporting the future of Pakistani politics. People showed shifting their vote and loyalties to PTI in future elections of 2013 because the leader of PTI is honest in delivering his promises. PTI gave more importance to education. In addition to giving importance to commitments of PTI, people wanted to give a chance to the other party or person because as the time had passed the existing parties have become corrupted. In election 2018 they had attraction with the slogans and party program of Naya Pakistan of PTI. Most of the young voters cast their vote for Imran Khan and Naya Pakistan. The campaign strategy adopted by PTI created great impact on the vote bank of Pakistan; especially women voters cast their votes with great enthusiasm to Imran Khan.

In election of 2018, PTI emerged as winning and ruling party due to its election campaign strategy and manifesto, under the leadership of Imran Khan and defeated the political dynastic elites of Pakistan. He introduced the slogan of Naya Pakistan (new Pakistan). In the manifesto of PTI there was three chapters which reflected the Naya Pakistan with the propaganda of the development of Pakistan on the basis of social, economic and security issues. PTI also raised the issue of corruption of PML(N) and PPP, party leaders used to say the leaders of chor and dakko (thief and plunderer).

PTI used social media to propagate the agenda of Naya Pakistan, they highlighted the issues of corruption of Prime Minister of PML (N) Mian Nawaz Sharif and they emphasized the culture of Dharna to popularized their agenda against corruption. Women and youth voters are also the main cause of the success of PTI.

From 11th April, 2022 to onward the Mian Muhammad Shahbaz Sharif the leader of PML N again established its coalitional government after the successes of no confidence movement. PPP also the big partner of the coalition other than MQM, JUI, etc. It is not only the failure of the slogan of Naya Pakistan but also the success of the dynastic political elite of Pakistan who are now again ruling in Pakistan.

REFERENCES

- Afridi, M.K. Ullah, T. & Gul, U. (2016). Electoral Politics of Jamat-e-Islami Pakistan (1987-2009). *Global Social Sciences Review*, 1(1), 58-76.
- Ahmed, S. Skoric, M. (2015). Twitter and 2013 Pakistan general election: The case of David 2.0 against Goliaths. In *Case Studies in e-Government 2.0* Springer, Cham. 139-161.
- Ahmed, S., Cho, J. & Jaidka, K. (2017). Leveling the playing field: The use of Twitter by politicians during the 2014 Indian general election campaign. *Telematics and Informatics*, 34(7). 1377-1386.

- Ali, S. (2016). Pakistan: Gov't postpones by-election in face of support for jailed socialist. *Green Left Weekly*, 13.
- Feyyaz, M. (2019). Contextualizing the pulwama attack in kashmir—a perspective from pakistan. *Perspectives on Terrorism*, 13(2).69-74.
- Hafeez, M. (2015). The Anatomy of the Modi Phenomenon—How Should Pakistan Deal With It?. *Strategic Studies*, 35(4).61-79.
- Hyman, A. (2019). *Pakistan: Towards a Modern Muslim State?* Routledge. 57-90.
- Jamil, S. (2018). Politics in a Digital Age: The Impact of New Media Technologies on Public Participation and Political Campaign in Pakistan's (2018) Elections—A Case Study of Karachi. *Global Media Journal*, 16(31).1-9.
- Khan, S., Razzi Abbas Jafri, R. & Baig, & N., Shaique, M. & Usman, M. (2017). Stock index manipulation around election announcements: evidence from Pakistan stock exchange. *International Journal of Accounting and Economics Studies*, 5(2).87-91.
- Masiha, S., Habiba, U., Abbas, Z., Saud, M. & Ariadi, S. (2018). Exploring the link between the use of facebook and political participation among youth in Pakistan. *Journal of Political Sciences & Public Affairs*, 6(1).1-7.
- Nadaf, A.H. (2020). Framing internal politics in a conflict situation: A study of the 2014 election campaign news in the local newspapers in the Indian-administered Kashmir region. *Media, War & Conflict*, 13(2).111-132.
- Razzaq, M.A., Qamar, A.M. and Bilal, H.S.M. (2014), August. Prediction and analysis of Pakistan election 2013 based on sentiment analysis. In *2014 IEEE/ACM International Conference on Advances in Social Networks Analysis and Mining (ASONAM 2014)*. 700-703.
- Saleem, N., Hanan, M.A. and Tariq, T. (2015). Political Advertisements and Voters Behaviour in 2013 General Elections of Pakistan: Exposure vs Impact Analysis. *Journal of the Research Society of Pakistan*, 52(1).
- Sanghro, R.R. and Chandio, J.A. (2019). Emerging the concept of Islamic Socialism in Pakistan: Historical analysis on political debates of 1970-1971 election campaign. *Journal of History Culture and Art Research*, 8(2).51-61.
- Saud, M. (2020). Youth participation in political activities: The art of participation in Bhakkar, Punjab Pakistan. *Journal Of Human Behavior In The Social Environment*, 30(6).760-777.
- Shah, A. (2019). Pakistan in 2018: Theft of an Election. *Asian Survey*, 59(1).98-107.
- Yao, H., Haris, M. and Tariq, G. (2018). Profitability determinants of financial institutions: evidence from banks in Pakistan. *International Journal of Financial Studies*, 6(2).53.