

ABROGATION OF ACT 370 AND 35A: DIVERSE REALITIES REPRESENTED IN PAKISTANI, INDIAN AND INTERNATIONAL MEDIA DISCOURSE

Arshad Mehmood

Assistant Professor & Head of English Department, Women University of AJ&K, Bagh
arshad_uck@yahoo.com

Muhammad Mushtaq

Dean Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences, Women University of AJ&K, Bagh
hodeducationwuajkb@gmail.com

Shabana Azad

Lecturer & Coordinator, Mohay-ud-Din Islamic University Nerian Shareef, Azad Kashmir
shabanaazad4349@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

Representation of international issues in electronic media related to occupied territories has long been the focus of scholarly discussion. Kashmir is still a disputed territory between India and Pakistan and on this issue both these atomic powers fought around three wars which resulted in financial and human loss from both sides. However, before 5th August 2019, in constitution of India, people of Indian occupied Kashmir were enjoying special status which was abrogated and Indian government imposed lockdown to suppress the voice of Kashmiris against this act. Pakistani and Indian media reported this Discursive event to highlight the perspectives of their own governments. But international TV channels reported the issue differently. Keeping in view the significance of this phenomenon, the current study was conducted to investigate the representation of this issue in the respective TV channels of these countries and reporting of the international TV channels as well. In this concern, data was collected from randomly selected TV channels between 5th August 2019 and September 5th 2019. The obtained data was analysed by using Discourse Historical method of Wodak (2007) and the focus of the study was to explore Predication and Nomination strategies used in the discourses of the selected channels. The study finds that Pakistani and Indian electronic media presented the issue in line with self-projected and self-justified viewpoints of the concerned governments instead of highlighting their own objective opinion which needs to be re-addressed.

Keywords: Ideological representation, International media, Indian media, Pakistani media, Kashmir issue.

INTRODUCTION

Kashmir issue is an unattended and unresolved international issue which is a hearth between two atomic powers, India and Pakistan where a little spark can spoil peace of the entire world. According to UN resolutions, Kashmiris have the right of plebiscite to decide their destiny by living independent or with Pakistan or India. However, Pakistan claims Kashmir as its life vein and India claims Kashmir as its integral part. On the basis of their claims, both these countries have fought wars in 1965, 1971 and 1998 including many other small combats. United Nations accepted the right of self-determination for Kashmiris and on both sides of Kashmir, they were enjoying special status in this state but on 5th August, 2019, India abrogated Act 370 and 35A unilaterally without the consent of the main stake holders, Kashmiris and imposed complete curfew till now. Kashmiri people did not accept this act of India, but Indian media highlighted Indian government stance and reported this act of abrogation in such a way as it was highly beneficial step of Indian Prime Minister, Modi for Kashmiri people. On the other hand, Pakistan media reported it in an interrogative manner addressing UN in their headlines produced after 5th August 2020. However, International media raised the voice in favor of Kashmiri people which was negation of Indian claim of pleasing expression by Kashmiri people. Therefore, this phenomenon has been investigated by using Wodak (2007) discourse-historical method through nomination strategies and predication strategies.

Research Questions

- How has international media highlighted visually Indian act of abrogation of Act 370 and 35A?
- How has Indian media channels linguistically represented abrogation of Act 370 and 35A by using nomination and predication strategies?
- How has Pakistani media channels linguistically represented abrogation of Act 370 and 35A by using nomination and predication strategies?

To find the answer of the first research question, visual representation retrieved from Aljazeera, Human Rights Watch and BBC Srinagar has been presented below:

Figure 1 Kashmir under lockdown: Aljazeera



<https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2019/10/27/kashmir-under-lockdown-all-the-latest-updates>

The above figure shows strict lockdown imposed in Indian occupied Kashmir negates Indian claim that Kashmiri people are happy on the abrogation of Article 370 and 35A which grant special status to the state of Jammu and Kashmir. Indian media claimed that Kashmiris were happy and they welcomed to be part of India, but neutral media forums exposed Indian claim regarding the issue.

Figure 2: India revokes Kashmir's special status: Human Rights Watch



<https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2019/9/4/india-revokes-kashmirs-special-status>

The figure above affirms Human Rights claim that India sent thousands of additional troops to the disputed region, imposed a crippling curfew, shut down telecommunications and internet, and arrested political leaders.

Figure 3 Article 370: Curfew in Kashmir as protesters plan 'black day': BBC, Srinagar



<https://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-india-536463224>th August 2019

Figure 3 confirms the report of BBC Srinagar about a state of perennial lockdown in Kashmir where they express that silence haunts the streets of Srinagar, with Indian paramilitary soldiers keeping a close eye on the movement of people.

REVIEW OF LITERATURE

The previous decades have observed widespread interest particularly in linguistic construction of ideologies and the manner these are restructured in discourse to accomplish numerous academic, discursual, interactional and social functions. Most of these studies received the influence of Foucauldian and social constructivist approaches concentrated on discourse as an unfixed, compliant, and intermediated procedure in a variety of spheres of systematic, mass media and political discourses. Current discourse studies within media communication emphasize the multifarious nature of discourses. The findings of these study demonstrate that media persons embed political ideologies in a single text or conversation. (Apfelbaum, 2003; Douglas, 2009; Partington, 2003). Similarly, within political discourse, politicians take a discursive dimension to speak on certain national and international issues to get dominance over the other competing discourses within the country or across the boundaries (Bayram, 2010; Bwenge, 2009; Ilie, 2010; Lauerbach, 2006; Qaiwer, 2016; Scot, 2015; Skendery, 2014; Zhong, 2014). Some other studies have examined the political discourses produced with positive self-representation and 'other' negative representation (Chilton, 2004). Moreover, in such studies, discourse analysts have found particularly how political discourse producers represented other political and social participants of the discourses. (Augoustinos & Riggs, 2007; Pyykko, 2003; Reisigl & Wodak, 2001; Tekin, 2010; Van Leeuwen, 2008; Wodak, Cillia, Reisigl & Liebhart, 2009; Zhou, 2003). These studied adhered to the notion that self or other representation in media discourses are always associated with power relations (Foucault). In other words, these power relations follow and represent hierarchical structure existing in a society or culture (Duncan, 2003; Fairclough, 1989). As was stated by Duncan (2003), when expressing an identity "there is always an issue of power at hand" (p. 150).

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

The study is qualitative in nature where the data was collected from Indian and Pakistani channels in the form of headlines as well as from the visual representation of Aljazeera, Human Rights Watch and BBC, Srinagar on the Discourse Event (DE), the annulment of special position of Indian occupied Kashmir unilaterally through the removal of their Act 370 and section 35A from their constitution reported between August 5, 2019 and September 5, 2019. The data was analysed by using Discourse-Historical method of Wodak (2007) within the broader Critical Discourse Analytic perspective. The findings of the study reveal how self-projected version and other de promoted strategies on selected issue worked through the media discourse to endorse 'self-justified and self-clarity policy' by both the regional atomic powers in the region.

DATA ANALYSIS

Kappa Measure of Agreement

Kappa measure of agreement (Banerjee, 1999) has been used to check the data for subcategories of both predication and nomination variables. Table below shows moderate to very good agreement between the two raters.

Strategies	n	Kappa Value
Membership categorization	298	.77**
Suppression	305	.80**
Direct reference	697	.95**
Depersonalization	422	.52**
Prediction	449	.89**

Note. * = moderate agreement; ** = very good agreement (Pallant, 2007, Kappa Measure of Agreement: .5= moderate; .7= good; above .8 = very good agreement) $p < .001$

Headlines of Indian Media Channels

The headlines data was collected from ARNAB Goswami on the topic, The Debate: Kashmir Integrated from Indian channel, R. Republic Media Network on 06th August 2019 viewed by 132,974 viewers. On the back of Goswami and other participants, live videos were running to show drum beaters and different groups of people dancing.

- 1- I met with some people today after half past eleven when the story was broken from Jaipur, and Delhi and some other parts, I saw them dancing and hugging and congratulating each other on Modi's correction of Nehru's Kashmir blunder.
- 2- I salute all of you.
- 3- Conflict entrepreneurs tremble.
- 4- 72 years in 5 minutes.
- 5- 72 years wait has ended.
- 6- A move to change Kashmir's destiny.
- 7- People of Kashmir have won today.
- 8- Kashmir history rewritten.
- 9- Historic move by Modi government.
- 10- Kashmir back.
- 11- India celebrates Kashmir integration.
- 12- Kashmir fully integrated now.
- 13- Modi undoes Nehru's Kashmir blunder.
- 14- People of Jammu Welcome Government's Decision to Scrap Article 370. (Retrieved from *AajTak TV* on Aug 5, 2019, viewers: 598,243).
- 15- J&K: Amit Shah's Role in Abrogation Of 370 (Retrieved from *ABP News* on Aug 11, 2019, viewers: 40,699).
- 16- Dream came true: important points of Modi's speech on 09 August 2019
- 17- Congratulations to the people of Ladakh and people of Kashmir.
- 18- What people of Kashmir gained with 370 and 35A?
- 19- People lost families faced terrorism and lost their living means.
- 20- People will be able to gain new opportunities and equal resources in new Kashmir.

The noun 'people' in the 1st, 8th headlines, 14th, 16th, 17th and 18th, and 'families' in 3rd headline have been used. People in the first headline are referred to those living in India and favouring abrogation while the same noun in other headlines is referred to the people of Kashmir. Second *collectivization category*, 'families' is referred to Pakistanis. Second subcategory is *criminalization* which refers to other people who were involved or not involved in a criminal act. In this respect, the word, 'entrepreneurs' has been used as a reference to Pakistanis who are supposedly backing terrorist activities. *De-spatialization* is referred to local orientations, for example, 'Indians' is referred to Indian Prime Minister. In the first headline, the words like, 'Delhi, Jaipur, and 'Nehru' in first and 8th example are the words referred to India and Congress respectively. *Dissimilation category* has also been found but rarely in the headlines. Dissimilation is used to nominate the individuals belonging to an outside category. In this concern, the noun, 'entrepreneurs' already analysed as belonged to criminalization category, has been used as dissimilation as well. In the same way, 'Nehru' has also been used as belonging to an outside category, for instance, 'congress'. *Mediafication* is another category used to refer to media sources showing them as participants of the event. This category was not found from the

headlines. *Organizationalization* is another category in which participants are named after their organization, for instance, Al-Qaidi is referred to Al-Qaida, or now in Pakistan, 'youthias' and 'patwaris' are referred to PTI and PML-N respectively. In the above headlines, the first headline includes 'Nehru' which refers to Congress party, in 3rd and 14th headlines, the noun, 'government' are examples of the current category. Another subcategory is *politicization* which refers the participants to political party they belong to. No such category was found from the headlines. *Professionalization* is that subcategory which nominates someone on the basis of his/her professional or official status. In this respect, Modi, Nehru, and Amit Shah belong to this category. *Religionization* is a category nominates the people on the basis of their religious affiliation. This category was also not found in these headlines. Next category is *spatialization* which is referred to places, for example, towns, states and countries. In this regard, 'Jaipur', 'Ladakh', 'Jammu' and 'Delhi' were used once while Kashmir was used ten times in the headlines of Indian media channels.

Nomination Strategy

The data has been analysed by Using Wodak's (2007) approach of CDA taken as guideline. During the analysis, four major nomination strategies including membership categories, direct reference, depersonalization and suppression were found from the selected data. Membership categories include further 10 other categories.

Collectivization

Collectivization is referred to allusions represented in a collective way. Bold linguistic items are the examples of collectivization.

Direct reference

Direct reference is second major nomination category which refers to participants' first or last name may be used with title or without a title. Only Modi, and Amit Shah have been used as direct reference.

Depersonalization

Depersonalization is used as metaphor to dehumanize the social actors. For example, 'donkey' is now-a-days used for PM Imran. Only the noun, 'entrepreneurs' has been used in these headlines indicating to Pakistanis who according to their point of view used to fund the terrorists in Kashmir.

Suppression/exclusion

This device is used to exclude a participant or participants from the discourse event. No such device (s) were used in these headlines.

Anonymization

Anonymization is a category like suppression and in both these categories, vague use of nouns or noun phrases are used to avoid naming the participants. This category has also not found in the above headlines.

Backgrounding

This category is consisted of process nouns or nominalizations in order to deliberately background the agent from the event. This category is present only in 16th headline where the headline statement starts with, 'dream'.

Results for nomination strategy

Direct references are present. Religionization, mediafication and politicization, suppression and anonymization subcategories are not present. The same noun or noun phrase come under more than one category, particularly, organizational, criminalization and dissimulation categories. Backgrounding and depersonalization categories were rarely used.

Predication Strategy

Wodak (2007) categorized predication category into two types: identification category and characterization category.

Identification category

Identification category is used to designate a social actor or an entity as holding a distinctive characteristic. Indian media channels used identification category in most of the headlines including the phrases, like 'conflict entrepreneurs', 'Kashmir's destiny', 'historic move', 'Nehru's blunder', 'scrap Article', 'new opportunities', 'new Kashmir' in a manner to portray the action of Modi government, and state of new Kashmir as a victory.

Characterization

Characterization is linguistically detained by the use of attributive choices within relational clauses and it is illuminated as attributive nouns/noun phrases and adjectives. In this regard, 'dancing, hugging and

congratulating', 'tremble', 'Kashmir integration', 'fully integrated', 'ended', 'won', 'rewritten', 'Modi undoes', 'Modi's correction', 'Kashmir gained', and 'Amit Shah's role' are the phrases and clauses which highlight the abrogation of Article 370 as a heroic action and Modi and Amit Shah are represented as the heroes of Kashmir story.

- **Headlines from Pakistani Media Channels**

Pakistani channels showed old pictures of Indian army soldiers with guns, UN's meeting sessions, Pakistani soldiers with weapons, Kashmiri women protesters and Kashmiri old and young protesters with Pakistan flags.

- 1- Pakistani Flags Wave in Kashmir, United Nation takes final decision about Article 370. (Retrieved from *Naya Pakistan Global* on 7th Aug 2019 viewed by 4,214 viewers.
- 2- Will international conscience awake on this brutality? (ARY, 6th Aug 2019, viewed by 14,772 viewers)
- 3- What Pakistan should do now?
- 4- What role OIC can play now?
- 5- Foreign Minister of Pakistan, Shah Mehmood Qureshi writes letter to UN awaring about the intensifying situation in Kashmir.
- 6- Indian intentions put peace of South Asian region under threat. (Retrieved from GEO on 5th Aug 2019, viewed by 350,370 viewers.
- 7- Pakistan and India head-to-head towards war.
- 8- Modi threw Trump's offer of arbitration to dustbin.
- 9- One more subversive plot of Modi (Retrieved from SAMA TV, viewed by 130,360 viewers on 9th Aug 2019.
- 10- Pakistan's Timid Response to India on Kashmir? Najam Sethi Show (Retrieved from HD News on 7 Aug 2019 viewed by 332,690 viewers.
- 11- Is India going to attack Azad Kashmir Next? (Retrieved from TAG TV on 7th Aug 2019 viewed by 673,696 viewers).
- 12- Is Gilgit Baltistan going to be a part of India?

Syntactic structure of the headlines constructed and presented in different media channels of Pakistan are in interrogative form raising the questions related to happenings expected on Kashmir issue in future. Applying nomination strategy of discourse-historical approach of Wodak (2007), we found the headlines 21,23,24,25,27,30,31 and 32 as category of collectivization allocating collective references to others, like United Nation, Pakistan, OIC, Pakistan, India, India, Azad Kashmir, Gilgit Baltistan. No criminalization category has been found from the headlines while de-spatialization strategy has found from headline 26 referring the threat as 'Indian' intentions. However, dissimulation category and mediafication categories have not been used as we know that the former category refers to nominate the participants as outside category, and the latter one is used to personify media sources. Proper nouns, 'United Nation' in headline 21, and 'OIC' in 24, have been used as organizational category because it refers to naming participant on the basis of organization. Professionalization category has been used in headline 26 referring Shah Mehmood Qureshi as Foreign Minister of Pakistan who reacted against abrogation of article 370 and wrote a letter to United Nation. Politicization, religionization, and spatialization categories have not been used in headlines of Pakistani channels.

Direct reference

Direct reference is used informally referring first or last names of the participants, may be with or without title. In this respect, in the headlines 28 and 29, Modi, Trump and Modi, have been used as direct reference to refer to their actions on Kashmir issue.

Depersonalization

This category is referred to using metaphors to dehumanize a person which has not been found in the headlines produced by media channels of Pakistan.

Suppression/exclusion

This category is used to exclude the participants from the discourse event. In this respect, anonymization and backgrounding strategies are used in passive structures. For the headline 21 to 32 are built upon Kashmir issue but the voice of Kashmiris has been backgrounded and not presented them in any single headline.

Predication Strategy

Wodak (2007) categorized predication category into two types: identification category and characterization category.

Identification category

Identification category is used to identify to nominate a social actor as possessing a unique attribute. No such category has been used in the headlines of media channels of Pakistan.

Characterization

This category is linguistically apprehended by the prenominal choices within relational clauses and it is used to illustrate entities, specifically, attributive nouns/noun phrases and adjectives. In this respect, 'international conscience', 'brutality', 'Indian intentions', 'threw into dustbin', and 'subversive plot of Modi' have been used portraying the role of international community and PM Modi in a negative manner. On the other hand, use of proper nouns 'United Nations', 'OIC' and 'Pakistan's timid role are the characterization categories used to show unsatisfactory role of these organizations and that of Pakistan.

DISCUSSION

Based on Wodak's discourse historical approach (Wodak & Meyer, 2001; Wodak, 2007; Wodak et al., 2009), subcategories of Nomination strategies are used for inclusion and exclusion of social actors including collectivization, criminalization, De-spatialization, dissimulation, organizationalization, politicization, professionalization, regionalization, spatialization, modification, and dissimulation. In this respect, the results show that Indian media used 07 collectivization strategies, 01 criminalization strategy, 04 De-spatialization strategies, 03 organizationalization strategies, 03 professionalization strategies, 14 spatialization strategies, and 02 dissimulation strategies. However, Indian media did not use politicization strategy, religionization strategy and modification strategies in their headline discourse. On the other hand, Pakistani media used 08 collectivization strategies, 01 De-spatialization strategy, 02 organizationalization strategies and one professionalization strategy which indicate that Indian media channels greatly used membership categories to portray Kashmiris acceptance for abrogation of the Act 370 and 35A.

Second major nominalization strategy is the use of direct reference, depersonalization and suppression. In this respect, we found 02 direct references, 01 depersonalization strategy and 01 suppression strategy in Indian headline discourse. On the other hand, Pakistani media channels used 03 direct references, and 11 suppression strategies which indicate that Pakistani media used greater number of major nomination strategies to project the phenomenon by excluding Indians from the discourse and their focus particularly remained on the future scenario.

With respect to the use of predication strategies, 'identification' as sub-category is used to give unique identity to a political actor while other sub-category, 'characterization category' is used to classify the member of a group as possessing a unique attribute. Indian media channels used 07 identification strategies and 13 characterization strategies whereas Pakistani media channels used 08 characterization strategies and did not use any single identification category in their discourse of headlines. The results show that Indian media portrayed their act of abrogation as a unique and heroic effort as compared to Pakistani media channels which seemed confused to respond to the abrogation of Act 370 and 35A.

CONCLUSION

This study was conducted to investigate the discourse produced by Pakistani and Indian media channels on abrogation of Act 370 and 35A by Indian government from their constitution. In this regard, the study was set out from the perspective of Critical Discourse Analysis by using discourse-historical approach of Wodak (2007). The results indicate that Indian media channels used both nomination and predication strategies at a higher scale as compared to Pakistani media channels. This trend of using both the strategies indicate that Indian media portrayed the discursive event in a heroic way while discursal response of Pakistani media was neither in favour of Kashmiri people nor clearly against India, rather it was mostly about the future scenario.

REFERENCES

Apfelbaum, B. (2002). Constructing identities in language learning MOOs. *Us and Others: Social Identities Across Languages, Discourses and Cultures*, 98, 111.

- Augoustinos, M., & Riggs, D. (2007). Representing "Us" and "Them". In *Social Representations and Identity* (pp. 109-130). Palgrave Macmillan, New York.
- Banerjee, M., Capozzoli, M., McSweeney, L., & Sinha, D. (1999). Beyond kappa: A review of interrater agreement measures. *Canadian journal of statistics*, 27(1), 3-23.
- Bwenge, C. (2009). Linguistic identity (re) construction in electoral politics: The case of 2005 Tanzanian parliamentary campaigns. In *Selected proceedings of the 39th annual conference on African linguistics* (pp. 166-178).
- Bayram, F. (2010). Ideology and political discourse: A critical discourse analysis of Erdogan's political speech. *Annual Review of Education, Communication and Language Science*.
- Chilton, P. A. (2004). *Analysing political discourse: Theory and practice*. Psychology Press.
- Douglas, F. (2009). *Scottish newspapers, language and identity*. Edinburgh University Press.
- Duncan, R., Ringsdorf, H., & Satchi-Fainaro, R. (2006). Polymer therapeutics—polymers as drugs, drug and protein conjugates and gene delivery systems: past, present and future opportunities. *Journal of drug targeting*, 14(6), 337-341.
- Fairclough, N. (1989). *Language and power*. New York: Longman Group UK Limited.
- Fairclough, N. (2003). *Analysing discourse: Textual analysis for social research*. London: Routledge.
- Foucault, M., & Rabinow, P. (1997). *Essential works of Foucault, 1954-1988*.
- Gunther, A. C., Miller, N., & Liebhart, J. L. (2009). Assimilation and contrast in a test of the hostile media effect. *Communication Research*, 36(6), 747-764.
- Gurevitch, M., Bennett, T., Curran, J., & Woollacott, J. (Eds.). (1982). *Culture, society and the media* (pp. 56-90). London: Methuen.
- <https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2019/10/27/kashmir-under-lockdown-all-the-latest-updates>
- <https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2019/9/4/india-revokes-kashmirs-special-status>
- <https://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-india-53646322>
- <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=bzIBzWQd8A4>
- Ilie, C. (2010). Identity co-construction in parliamentary discourse practices. *European parliaments under scrutiny: Discourse strategies and interaction practices*, 57-78.
- Lauerbach, G. (2006). Discourse representation in political interviews: The construction of identities and relations through voicing and ventriloquizing. *Journal of Pragmatics*, 38(2), 196-215.
- Pallant, J. F., & Tennant, A. (2007). An introduction to the Rasch measurement model: an example using the Hospital Anxiety and Depression Scale (HADS). *British Journal of Clinical Psychology*, 46(1), 1-18.
- Partington, A. (2003). *The linguistics of political argument: The spin-doctor and the wolf-pack at the White House*. Routledge.
- Pyykkö, R. (2002). Who is 'us' in Russian political discourse? *Us and Others: Social identities across languages, discourses and cultures*, 98, 233.
- Qaiwer, S. N. (2016). *A study of identity construction in political discourse* (Doctoral dissertation, University of Nottingham).
- Reisigl, M., & Wodak, R. (2001). Discourse and Discrimination.
- Skenderi, E. (2014). *We the Balkanians: A critical discourse analysis of the political discourse*. Unpublished master's thesis). University of Bergen, Norway.
- Tekin, B. Ç. (2010). Representations and othering in discourse. *Discourse Approaches to Politics, Society and Culture*, 39, 153-204.
- Triandafyllidou, A., & Wodak, R. (2003). Conceptual and methodological questions in the study of collective identities: An introduction. *Journal of Language and Politics*, 2(2), 205-223.
- Van Leeuwen, T. (2008). *Discourse and practice: New tools for critical discourse analysis*. Oxford university press.
- Wodak, R. (2007). Discourses in European Union organizations: Aspects of access, participation, and exclusion. *Text & Talk*, 27.
- Wodak, R. (2009). *The discourse of politics in action: Politics as usual*. Springer.
- Wodak, R. (2009). *Discursive construction of national identity*. Edinburgh University Press.
- Wodak, R., & Meyer, M. (Eds.). (2015). *Methods of critical discourse studies*. Sage.
- Zhong, Y. (2014). A critical discourse analysis of government spokesman's identity construction: A case study. *International Journal of English Linguistics*, 4(3), 74.

Abrogation of Act 370 and 35A: Diverse Realities Represented in Pakistani, Indian and International Media Discourse

Zhou, M. (2002). Between us and them in Chinese. *Us and others: Social identities across languages, discourses and cultures*, 98, 51.