

WHEN ALTERNATIVES EXIST! PROBING TELEOLOGICAL USE OF ENGLISH WORDS IN URDU EDITORIALS

Seemab Far Bukhari*

PhD, Department of Communication and Media Research, University of the Punjab, Lahore
Seemab.ics@pu.edu.pk

Sehreen Far Bokhari

PhD, Department of Philosophy, University of the Punjab, Pakistan
sehreen.phil@pu.edu.pk

Wafa Naz

School of Communication Studies, University of the Punjab, Lahore

ABSTRACT

Regionally and internationally, the competition between languages is increased because of globalisation. Both sociolinguistic and Journalistic schools have extensive evidence of how quickly and unpredictably English has expanded over the world in comparison to other major languages. By addressing the grey area between Journalism and Philosophy of Ethics, the study explores teleological use of English words in the editorial contents of mainstream Urdu Newspapers of Pakistan. It categorizes the Urdu words used in two mainstream Urdu newspapers i-e Jang and Nawa-i-Waqt into further categories to take an in depth analysis of their usage. The method used is content analysis. All the hypotheses are proven on the findings of P value as 0.000. The findings revealed that Daily Nawa-i-Waqt used more common English words in their editorial as compared to Daily Jang in the taken universe.

Keywords: Teleological, communication and language, deontological, linguistic

INTRODUCTION

As a popular medium for delivering news and viewpoints, the common person's essential necessity is a newspaper, its main goal is to deliver news and information with many viewpoints through comments, articles, and editorials (Rahman, 1996; Shoeb, 2007; Ahmed, 1996; Ezdi, 2012). Despite challenged technologically from Digital media, newspapers also have significant social and educational importance in today's society. As a result, it is referred to as the "people's university" (Rathore, 2012; Rahman, 1996). On the same point as, newspapers have always had a big impact on how the world sees things, the editorial is the most significant part of the newspaper since it shapes public opinion on a given topic (Shoeb, 2007; Ahmed, 1996).

The language of media is acknowledged as a distinct variation of style, distinguished by a particular communicative goal and its own set of linguistic devices (McIntyre, 1998). It has a system of interconnected lexical, phraseological, and grammatical devices intended to teach, instruct, and entertain the reader (Adersen, 1996). Newspapers serve a variety of objectives, therefore they don't just provide information; they also include opinions and comments from the news writers, that are particularly common in editorials and feature articles (Boatright, 1997; Ahmed, 1996).

The idea of ethics as a field of study is concerned with morality, moral responsibility, and action. Since morality is the subject of ethics, the terms ethics and morality are interrelated. Socially it denotes a society's morality, the moral precepts and ideals that guide and shape people's lives, culture and practices (Meriel & Kelly, 1978).

Typically, ethical viewpoints are categorised into one of three broad groups. Differentiating between teleological, deontological, and virtue ethics theories is a popular practise (Fisher, 2003; Jonsson, 2011; Rozman, 2012; Boatright, 1997). Choosing a certain path of action must be based on an assessment of the outcomes, according to teleological ethics theories. As the most significant

* Corresponding Author

component of culture, language of national media is the primary characteristic used to identify nationality or ethnicity of the inhabitants of a society. The factor unifies people and distinguishes them from other groups. Language serves as a symbol of people's history and identity (Phillipson, 1992). Ezdi (2012) says language enforces a particular way of thinking in addition to serving as a means of communication. It effectively drives mental processes. Thus, linguistic ambiguity causes clouded thinking and erroneous decisions (Rathore, 2012).

The majority of Pakistani mainstream Urdu newspapers employ a lot of English words and phrases. However, some English words, such as those that are complex and may have irrelevant meanings when translated, are employed in editorial writing (Rathore, 2012). Similar to this, English words with English roots but no equivalent in Urdu may be employed in editorial writing, such as refrigerator, television, etc. However, several words can be easily expressed in Urdu but are commonly translated into English. The most regrettable aspect is that Pakistan's major Urdu publications routinely engage in this behaviour.

This could be interpreted as a covert invasion of English that affects how the national language is used by the media in Pakistan (Ezdi, 2012). According to Bansal (2021), India has inherited the colonial legacy of British colonisers' English language education. Education laws relating to the language of teaching in schools have unmistakably supported multilingual education since the country's independence. The policy requirements, though, have not been converted into classroom practises in the same way. Language has a significant role in defining one's identity, and because of the west's strong impact, English terminologies and terms are frequently used in mainstream Urdu media. Learning a global language or creating a bilingual society are wonderful things, but not at the expense of a language's unique identity when there are other options available (Ezdi, 2012). Other nations should hold on to their language and culture in order to preserve their long-term existence as the balance of world power shifts.

The study aims at analysing the medium of language used in the editorial of mainstream Urdu newspapers of Pakistan. The study includes different forms and types of English words used in the editorials of mainstream Urdu Newspapers of Pakistan that are further classified in different categories. The division enabled the researcher to determine the frequency and intensity of the usage of such English words in Urdu newspapers. The study enables to understand the influence of English language of newspapers over the readers, how Urdu editorials containing English words and terms are silently setting the agenda in people's minds about their national language and this is diminishing the worth of Urdu as national language of Pakistan.

It is assumed that there is a sufficient use of English words in the editorials of mainstream Pakistani Urdu Newspapers. Despite the availability of translated alternatives, common English words, English terminologies and English Compound words are used in the editorials. The basic purpose of this study is to understand the concept of silent invasion of English language through Urdu newspapers, and the role of Urdu newspapers as facilitator to this process. It also seeks out to comprehend the importance of Urdu as national language and realize how the global language 'English' is replacing the cultural heritage of Pakistan. This study provides a handful of facts regarding where and how the language of Pakistani Urdu newspapers is affecting the lexical choices of the citizens. It provides solutions for getting the respect and dignity of Urdu as national language. After conducting the pilot study, the data for this study is coded in five categories as A-E respectively.

As the combinations of two words, *Compound Words* make category A. Although these word combinations may have an Urdu translation for either one or both of the individual terms, the translation results in an absurd connotation that is not rationally acceptable. For example the expression *Banana Republic or Olive's Branch* is frequently used in English or Western journalism but the literal translation of these words may not create a good image and may miscommunicate likewise. Category B words are those English terms that have their roots in the English language but have no equivalents in Urdu. The examples of such words are *Air Conditioners, Refrigerators, Hair Dryers, Washing Machines* etc. These words are usually titles for machinery items or names of places.

The words in Category C are those that have an Urdu equivalent but are commonly used in editorials of mainstream Urdu publications despite having an Urdu translation i.e. Elections, (*Intikhabat*), Presidency (*Aiwan –e-Sadar*), Iqbal Day (*Youm-e-Iqbal*), Refrendum (*Istaswab-e-Raey*), Holiday (*Tateel*), Fashion (*Rawaj*), the category is the base of this study. It collects evidences to prove the main thesis for this study as in the presence of Urdu alternatives whether or not Urdu press publishes

them for English expressions. The fourth category D contains English terms that may have an Urdu translation but are employed as terms for the knowledge of common people. These terms may also contain titles of accords or treaties, among other things as *New World Order*, *Duchess of York*, *Congress of Vienna* etc. In Category E, Abbreviations and any other exceptional English words that do not fit into one of the categories above are included, that is referred to as others. The growing popularity of English as a global language has been a threat in post-colonial societies, Throughout the course of history, nations strived to safeguard their languages as Ezdi (2012) illustrates that in order to safeguard the integrity of the French language, the French Academy was established as a formal authority in 1635. It was required to create new French vocabulary to replace English terminology that has found their way into French. Additionally, France has rules limiting the use of English on television and requiring translations of English slogans in commercials. In Germany, Russia, and Spain, there are unofficial academic or civil society organisations to prevent the blending of English words into the native language. Some linguists in China have also expressed concern about the proliferation of English loanwords in that language.

REVIEW OF LITERATURE

The study attempts to investigate how English words are used in editorials of popular Urdu newspapers in Pakistan. We evaluate studies on the influence of media on language, Pakistani culture, and studies on the influence of foreign cultures on Urdu. According to Ezdi (2012), Pakistan is not the only country experiencing a cultural invasion. The use of English terminology in the native language is opposed in a number of European nations, France in particular. Years ago, Jack Lang, who served as Mitterrand's minister of culture in France, warned of the risks of the "Coca Colonization of the Minds." Even older is the movement to eliminate foreign words from the French language.

According to Rathore (2012), it is incredibly regrettable that, along with the course of time, the scope of this magnificent language in Urdu in its early version has been severely condensed to the point that it has lost all of its beauty and meaning. He clarifies how important it was for the corporate sector and Pakistani media to portray Urdu speech as supporting English. As a practice, unlike in the past, the scripts for Urdu commercials, drama serials, and interactive presentations broadcast on various native television stations are not entirely written in Urdu. The inhabitants of Pakistan speak a mixture of languages instead, including Urdu, English, Hindi, and Punjabi. Further, he says that rather than being displayed in pure Urdu, terminology for stores, buildings, confidential and area firms, firms, etc. are typically displayed in English or Roman Urdu. This is just another calculated move by the corporate brokers and the media to undermine the usage of Urdu discourse at the national level

According to McIntyre (1998), exposure to western mass media causes established conventional benefits to erode and changes in governmental benefits or perceptions. According to Wolfgang (2004), English became the primary hiring foundation for Japanese in 1945 because of the language's dominating influence on Japanese sophistication and pronunciation. The Japanese continued to use English despite the language's vast typological distance from them, despite the fact that they view their language as a major factor in their sense of national pride. The majority of English words used in Japanese are acquired from the media, and they have varying effects on composed and informal Japanese.

The majority of English words used in Japanese are acquired from the media, and they have varying effects on composed and informal Japanese. According to McKenzie (2010), the continuing and seemingly never-ending process of globalisation has had and continues to have a significant impact on the economy. Among them is the growing financial interdependence of many cultures and regions of the world. Regionally and globally, the competition between languages has increased because of globalisation. Both sociolinguists and applied linguists have provided extensive evidence of how quickly and unpredictably English has expanded over the world in comparison to other major languages. The ever-growing quantity of English-language publications reflects the language's global dominance

Researchers have noted that the symbolic manipulation associated with English as the global language increases the observed prevalence of English above supplemental languages. Due to this, local English articulating asserts together with commercial strength like the merged assertions at an exporting dominance over other nations' traditional possessions. As English becomes a global language, elites and middle classes around the world have a propensity to adopt what can be called a "American way of life."

English has been sharply condemned by Phillipson (1992), who compared it to a tyrannosaurus that devours other languages, removes ingrained cultural practices, and thrives on the ruins of other populations' native tongues. Similar to Tsuda (1997), who contends that English's primacy led to communicative disparity, traditional conquest, and mental settlement. According to Adersen (1996), language planning is essential if a region wants to communicate specialized vision outside of the specialist communities. Additionally, it is crucial to increase the rate at which languages can adapt to rapidly changing social circumstances. In Norway, this perspective has been receiving increasing attention in recent years.

In order to enhance the development of Norwegian terminology, steps have been taken to introduce established speech methods across the country and in higher education. Despite the implementation of these principles, however, little practical terminology work has been started. Newspapers have long been and continue to be a significant, influential medium for the dissemination of information, according to Shoeb (2007). Four Pakistani newspapers, two in Urdu and two in English, have their editorials scrutinised in this investigation. From November 3 to December 12, 2007, the duration of the emergency, the editorials were collected daily from the newspapers' online editions. The four papers that were chosen were Daily Times, Dawn, Nawa-i-Waqt, and Jang. Dawn is the managing English daily, while among the managing Urdu newspapers are Jang and Nawa-i-Waqt.

According to Ahmed (1996), the concepts of individuality and cognitive psychological processes are present in both Urdu and English. Urdu is emotional, but English is intellectual. Ahmed's Urdu-English/emotional-rational tear is problematic because it assumes western conceptions of reason and western mass media standards of professional journalism. Rahman (1996) investigates how language laws evolved into a political survival tactic. Urdu and English were politicized, which led to further divisions throughout the populace rather than bringing it together. While English was linked with the westernized elites who were more likely to support socialism or liberalism, Urdu came to be connected with the religious right wing for a variety of reasons.

Theoretical framework

The study is in accordance with the agenda-setting theory as the most popular news agencies are setting an agenda in people's minds that it is justified to include English words in sophisticated Urdu writings. The overuse of the English language affects the linguistics of readers and they unconsciously accept the fact that it would not affect their cultural identity. The distinctive way of life, values, and language that we have successfully maintained through the ages in a foreign and unfriendly environment is now more threatened than ever. Such promotion of Western norms may be seen as a sort of "cultural invasion" according to a description that will be provided later because it diminishes or replaces local ones.

It can be inferred that the mass media can significantly influence how people think. The agenda of the media eventually becomes the agenda of the public due to the mass media's agenda-setting function. The theory backs up the idea of powerful media effects. Since the people will eventually define the agenda, it is now the obligation of the media companies to do so responsibly. According to this view, media companies have a big duty because their careless actions can harm the interests of the country.

METHODOLOGY

Research Method

The study is done by employing Quantitative Content Analysis.

Research Tool

The data is collected through a coding sheet.

Unit of Analysis

Editorials are selected as the unit of analysis for present study.

Universe

The universe of this study is comprised on editorials of Daily Jang and Daily Nawa-i-Waqt published from January, 2011 to December, 2011.

Sample

To draw a representative sample from population, rules of systematic sampling are applied.

Operationalization of Categories

Title	Operationalization
Category A (Compound words)	Category A comprises English compound words. Compound words are a combination of two words. These combinations of words might have Urdu translation for single words or even both but after translating they will give an absurd meaning which is unacceptable.
Category B (Words Originated from English Language)	Category B words are such English words which are originated from the English language and do not have any Urdu alternative.
Category C (Words Having and Urdu Translation)	Category C defines such English words that have an Urdu translation, but despite the presence of Urdu alternatives they are frequently used in the editorials of mainstream Urdu newspapers.
Category D (English Terminologies)	Category D consists of English terminologies that might have an Urdu translation but they are used as terms these terminologies may also include names of agreements or treaties etc.
Category E (Others)	Category E named as others includes abbreviations and any other exceptional English word that does not fall in any of the above-mentioned categories.

Hypothesis Testing

Test and CI for One Proportion

H1: There is a sufficient number of English words used in the editorials of mainstream Urdu Newspapers of Pakistan.

Test of $p = 0.5$ vs. $p > 0.5$

95% Lower Exact

Sample	X	N	Sample p	Bound	P-Value
1	243	243	1.000000	0.987748	0.000

Interpretation

The table shows that the number of editorials that used English words in the editorials of mainstream Urdu newspapers of Pakistan. The p-value was 0.000 which is highly significant and does reject the null hypothesis and accept H1 hypothesis meaning that the above-stated hypothesis statement stands true based on the data collected and tabulated. This means that there is a sufficient number of English words in the editorials of mainstream Urdu newspapers in Pakistan.

H1: Nawa-i-Waqt uses more common English words in their editorial as compared to Jang.

Test and CI for Two Proportion

Test for difference = 0 (vs < 0): $Z = -7.95$

Difference = $p(1) - p(2)$

Estimate for difference: -0.134935

95% upper bound for difference: -0.107013

Fisher's exact test: P-Value = 0.000

Sample	X	N	Sample p	P-Value
1	521	1561	0.333670	0.000
2	801	1709	0.468695	0.000

The table shows the comparison of the usage of Category C words used in the editorials of Jang and Nawa-i-Waqt. The sample size N is 1561 and the number of common English words with available Urdu alternatives used in the editorials of Jang is 521 whereas the sample size N for Nawa-i-Waqt is 1709 and the number of common English words with available Urdu alternatives used in the editorials of Nawa-i-Waqt is 801. The P-Value is 0.000 which is highly significant. This means that Nawa-i-Waqt uses more common English words in its editorials as compared to Jang.

H1: Despite the availability of translated Urdu alternatives, there are a sufficient number of Common English words in the editorials of mainstream Urdu Newspapers of Pakistan.

Test and CI for One Proportion

Sample	X	N	Sample p	Bound	P-Value
1	1322	3270	0.404281	0.418610	0.000

Test of p= 0.5 vs p < 0.5

95% Lower Exact

Interpretation

The table shows that the number of common English used words with available Urdu alternative translation in the editorials of mainstream Urdu newspapers of Pakistan is 1322. The P Value is highly significant as 0.000. This means that despite the availability of translated Urdu alternatives, there are a sufficient number of Common English words in the editorials of mainstream Urdu Newspapers of Pakistan.

DISCUSSION AND ANALYSIS

The study interprets and investigates the usage and effects of English words used in the editorials of mainstream Urdu newspapers of Pakistan. The analysis of the above data derived from the classified categories leads this study to a conclusion based on rational and statistical grounds. The agenda setting theory served as the major part of the theoretical framework along with describing the relation between the usage of English words in editorials of Pakistani mainstream Urdu newspapers and its influence on Urdu as our national language.

The study highlights the category C words that have an Urdu translation, but despite of the presence of Urdu alternative they are frequently used in the editorials of mainstream Urdu newspapers. The total number of the editorial chosen from Jang are 243 and 1506 English words are used whereas from the Nawa-i-Waqt, the same amount of editorials is counted but the total number of English words are 1791.

The total number of English words from Jang in the month of January 2011 is 188, from that 188, 72 are from category C. In the month of February there are 75 words from the category C with 157 total numbers of English words and 102 from Nawa-i-Waqt. There are 22 words from the total of 52 in the month of March and 94 from Nawa-i-Waqt. In April, there are again 36 words from the category C that is the highest amount from the total of 101 and 55 from Nawa-i-Waqt. In the month of May, there are 56 words, the second best are 53 from the category B from the total number of English are 168 and 55 from Nawa-i-Waqt. Category B and C are the two most used categories in the editorials, the Category B has 35 and Category C has 44 words from 115 and 64 from Nawa-i-Waqt. In the month of July category D has the same words with the Category C which is 27 from 93 of total words 45 from Nawa-i-Waqt. There are 47 words from jang the month of August and 29 from Nawa-i-Waqt, 38 from jang in the month of September and 35 from Nawa-i-Waqt, 47 from Jang in the month October and 53 from Nawa-i-Waqt, 26 from jang in the month of November and 58 from Nawa-i-Waqt and 30 from jang in December and 65 from Nawa-i-Waqt.

The total number of English words of C category used in the editorials of daily Jang in the year 2011 is 520. On the other hand, the English words of C category used in the editorials of Nawa-i-Waqt in the year 2011 are 801. This demonstrates a big difference between the both. Hence, the hypothesis; Nawa-i-Waqt uses more common English words in their editorial publications compared to Jang, and despite translating terminologies available for common English words Urdu media is publishing more English words in the editorials of Urdu newspapers, turns out to be correct.

CONCLUSION

The study has attempted to investigate the usage of English words used in the editorials of mainstream Urdu newspapers in Pakistan. For this purpose, a content analysis was performed the study has led to achieving its defined objectives by testing the given hypothesis of this study under the interpretations derived from the data classified in certain categories. Based on the theoretical perspective of Agenda setting theory of mass communication the study examines how Pakistani mainstream Urdu newspapers through the representation of repetitive usage of English words in mainstream Urdu newspapers of Pakistan affect the linguistics of Pakistani readers.

The study aims to find out the usage and frequency of English words being used in the editorials of mainstream Urdu newspapers of Pakistan. It intends to identify the extent to which English words are used in main stream Urdu newspapers. Despite the availability of translated Urdu alternatives, there are a sufficient number of Common English words in the editorial contents of main stream Urdu Newspapers of Pakistan. This replacement of Urdu words is weakening the worth of our national language. In order to maintain the dignity and respect for our national language, the mainstream Urdu newspapers should completely avoid the use of English words.

REFERENCES

- Ahmed, N. (2016). *An exploration of Urdu medium students' perceptions of the English and Urdu languages in Pakistan* (M.A ELT dissertation). Institute of Education, University of London, UK.
- Ayre, J. (2012). *Cultural and linguistic capital, standardized tests and the perpetuation of educational inequities* (Doctoral dissertation). University of British Columbia, Canada.
- Bansal, G. (2021). The hegemony of English in science education in India: a case study exploring impact of teacher orientation in translating policy in practice. *Cultural Studies of Science Education*.
- Bashir, S., & Batool, F. (2017). English as medium of instruction in Punjab: The 2009 experiment. *Lahore Journal of Policy Studies*, 7(1), 13-45.
- Bourdieu, P. (1991). *Language and symbolic power*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Coleman, H. (2010). *Teaching and learning in Pakistan: The role of language in education*. Islamabad: British Council
- Ezdi, A. (2012). *A silent invasion*. Retrieved from <http://www.thenews.com.pk/Todays-News-9-129727-A-silent-invasion>
- Fareed, M., Jawed, S., & Awan, S. (2018). Teaching English language at SSC level in private non-elite schools in Pakistan: Practices and problems. *Journal of Education and Educational Development*, 5(1), 80-95.
- Gee, J. P. (2000). Identity as an analytic lens for research in education. *Review of Research in Education*, 25(1), 99-125.
- Government of Pakistan, (2009). National Education Policy. Islamabad: Ministry of Education.
- Government of Pakistan, (1973). The constitution of Pakistan. Retrieved from http://www.na.gov.pk/uploads/documents/1333523681_951.pdf.
- Harlech-Jones, B., Baig, M., & Sajid, S. (2005). Private schooling in the northern areas of Pakistan: A decade of rapid expansion. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 25(5), 557-568.
- Jalal, Z. (2004). Language policy in Pakistan. In S. Mansoor (Ed.), *Language policy, planning, & practice: A South Asian perspective* (pp. 23-26). Karachi. Oxford university Press.
- Jafri, I. H., Zai, S. Y., Arain, A. A., & Soomro, K. A. (2013). English background as the predictors for students' speaking skills in Pakistan. *Journal of Education and Practice*, 4(20), 30-35
- Mahboob, A. (2002). No English, no future: Language policy in Pakistan. In S. Obeng & B. Hartford (Eds.), *Political independence with linguistic servitude: The politics about languages in the developing world* (pp. 15-40). New York: NOVA Science
- Manan, S. A., & David, M. K. (2014). Mapping ecology of literacies in educational setting: The case of local mother tongues vis-à-vis Urdu and English languages in Pakistan. *Language and Education*, 28(3), 203-222.
- Mansoor, S. (2005). *Language planning in higher education: A case study*. Karachi: Oxford University Press.

- Mustafa, Z. (2015). *The tyranny of language in education: The problem and its solution*. Karachi: Oxford University Press.
- McKenzie, R. (2010), *The Social Psychology of English as a Global Language*
- McIntyre, B. (1998), *Mass Media in the Asian Pacific The English Influence on the Japanese Language - Borrowing as a Trend* (2004)Johann Wolfgang Goethe-University Frankfurt am Main- Department of American Studies
- Peirce, B. N. (1995). Social identity, investment, and language learning. *TESOL Quarterly*, 29(1), 9-31.
- Norton, B. (1997). Language, identity, and the ownership of English. *TESOL Quarterly*, 31(3), 409-429.
- Norton, B. (2013). Identity, literacy, and the multilingual classroom. The multilingual turn (pp. 113-132). New York: Routledge.
- Pavlenko, A. B. (2001). Negotiation of identities in multilingual contexts. *International Journal of Bilingualism*, 5(3), 243-257.
- Pavlenko, A., & Norton, B. (2007). *Imagined communities, identity, and English language learning*. International handbook of English language teaching (pp. 669-680). Boston: Springer.
- Rahman, T. (2006). Language policy, multilingualism and language vitality in Pakistan. Lesser- Known Languages of South Asia Status and Policies, Case Studies and Applications of Information Technology Trends in Linguistics. *Studies and Monographs*, 175, 71-84. doi:10.1515/9783110197785.1.73
- Rahman, T. (2004). *Denizens of alien worlds: A study of education, inequality and polarization in Pakistan*. Karachi: Oxford University Press.
- Rathore, U. (2012). *Linguistic dilemma and its impact on Pakistan*. Retrieved from http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2012%5C07%5C11%5Cstory_11-7-2012_pg_7_13
- Rahman, Tariq. Language and Politics in Pakistan. Karachi: Oxford UP, 1996. *Language Policy, Culture, And Identity in Asian Contexts* (2007).
- Amy Bik May Tsui & James W. Tollefson. Shamim, F. (2008). Trends, issues and challenges in English language education in Pakistan. *Asia Pacific Journal of Education*, 28(3), 235-249.
- Shamim, F. (2011). English as the language for development in Pakistan: Issues, challenges and possible solutions (pp. 2-20). In H. Coleman, (Ed.), *Dreams and realities: English in development*. London: The British Council.
- Tsuda, Y. (1997). Hegemony of English vs ecology of Language. In L.E. Smith & M.L. Forman (Eds.), *World Englishes 2000* (pp. 21-31). Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press. Window on Pakistani Media. Centre for Civic Education Pakistan. n.d.
- Vaish, V., & Tan, T. K. (2008). Language and social class: Linguistic capital in Singapore. Retrieved from <http://hdl.handle.net/10497/3339>
- Warwick, P. & Reimers, F. (2005). Hope or despair? Learning in Pakistan's primary schools. Westport: Praeger